Does hip strengthening increase functional outcomes and decrease pain in women with patellofemoral joint dysfunction? A systematic review

Ellen Jackson, SPT, Drew Lollar, SPT, Josh Lopez, SPT, Morgan Ogale, SPT, Tom Sneed, PT, DPT, OCS
Southwest Baptist University, Doctor of Physical Therapy Program

Introduction

Musculoskeletal injury, particularly knee pain, is becoming more prevalent in the female athletic population. Since Title IX was signed into law in 1972 mandating that individuals would not be excluded from educational activity, the amount of females participating in high school athletics has increased 902% and the amount of females participating in collegiate activities has increased 456%. This stark increase in active females has led to an increase in many musculoskeletal injuries much like their male counterparts. Knee pain is particularly common1. Yet one cause of knee pain that is more unique to female athletes and more difficult to fully resolve is patellofemoral joint dysfunction (PFJD). This particular problem seems to continue even long after the athlete has ceased competitive play due to an ongoing active lifestyle. The common treatment has been to treat the problem joint, the knee, but could individuals have a faster and better long term recovery when being treated with a more global approach? Treatment for PFJD has recently started to include the hip. Through the use of common physical therapy functional outcome measures, females appear to have benefited better when a physical therapist involves the hip joint in treatment along with the knee. This leads to the question of does hip strengthening increase functional outcomes and decrease pain in women with patellofemoral joint dysfunction?

Methods

Five collections of search terms were used to search databases resulting in 206 studies identified. The number of studies after duplicates were removed resulted in 49 studies. The 49 studies were screened via title and abstract for relevance and inclusion criteria of female subjects diagnosed with patellofemoral joint dysfunction and a hip-strengthening component of rehab. After this screening, 10 studies remained. The 10 studies were reviewed in full text leading to an additional 3 studies excluded. (See diagram above for outline of the process.) The 7 selected studies were evaluated to determine level of research and quality of study using the American Academy for Cerebral Palsy and Developmental Medicine (AACPDM) assessment tool2. The AACPDM uses a series of 7 yes or no response questions resulting in a scoring system out of possible 7. Scores of 6-7 yes responses are considered strong. Scores of 4-5 yes responses are considered moderately strong. Scores of 3 or less yes responses are considered weak.

Results

All studies were considered high level design being level II randomized controlled trials. Out of the 7 studies, 3 indicated strong quality of study, 3 moderate quality of study, and only 1 showed weak quality. Subjects placed in groups with a hip strengthening component in their treatment had a decrease in pain on the VAS and an increase in function via LEFS and isometric strength measures. Out of the 7 studies, 5 used the VAS, 5 used the LEFS, and 4 used isokinetic strength testing as outcome measures. The studies using VAS reduced scores from average 6.4 to 1.4, a 77.7% improvement. The studies using LEFS increased scores from 53.8 to 70.3, an average of 30.6% improvement. The studies using isokinetic strength all showed improvement with an average increase in strength of 25.9% compared to controls which decreased 4.3%. (See Table below for results of scoring the 7 selected studies.)

Discussion

Out of the seven studies that were reviewed and analyzed, some common functional outcome measures were noted. The lower extremity functional scale (LEFS)1,2,7,8, visual analog scale (VAS)1-3,6,7,8 and isometric strength1,2,7,8 assessed by the use of a dynamometer were used in more than half of the studies. The inclusion criteria for the subjects in the studies reviewed were pain associated with functional activities such as ascending/descending stairs, hopping, running, squating, kneeling, prolonged sitting, and insidious onset of symptoms2,3,6,7. Exclusion criteria for the subjects in the studies reviewed included having other knee pathologies and history of knee surgery in the past year2,3,6,7. Among the studies, a hip strengthening component was necessary for inclusion into the systematic review2,3,5,6,7,8,9. There were variations in the approaches used for strengthening the hip joint between the studies that should be taken into consideration. One study separated their subjects into two exercise groups, a hip strengthening group and a quadriceps strengthening group. Both groups were on weight bearing and exercises were performed for four weeks. The subjects who performed knee exercises showed no significant improvements in pain reported by the VAS, while the hip group showed significant improvements in pain after four weeks. Both groups then performed the same weight bearing exercises after their initial four week intervention plan and showed equally significant improvements in pain and LEFS scores compared to the weight bearing exercises2. Throughout all the research open and closed chain exercises were used2,5,6,7,8,9. There was no indication as to why they were chosen other than it was the preference of the researchers. Based on these results, closed chain exercises for the hip and the knee should be included in therapeutic interventions and open chain exercises should be used sparingly.

Conclusion

Overall, the evidence supports that a hip-strengthening component is necessary to incorporate into a traditional physical therapy protocol for women with patellofemoral joint dysfunction. Adding the hip strengthening exercise components of hip flexors and abductors were shown to help decrease pain and improve function in all studies reviewed. It is unclear whether the hip strengthening exercises are better as open chain vs closed chain in nature. The improvements were evidenced from the various functional outcome measures, LEFS, VAS, and isokinetic strength test, that are typically used within the clinical setting indicating the usefulness of the hip exercises in a therapy protocol. Recommendations for therapists would be to treat these patients in a global treatment approach by strengthening the hip joint as well as focusing at the knee.

References

References are available upon request.